



BONN INTERNATIONAL CENTER FOR CONVERSION • INTERNATIONALES KONVERSIONSZENTRUM BONN

# paper *07*

## **Human Resources Development and Utilization in Demobilization and Reintegration Programs**

Irmgard Nübler  
January 1997

## CONTENTS

### PREFACE

### I. INTRODUCTION

### II. THE OBJECTIVES OF DEMOBILIZATION AND REINTEGRATION STRATEGIES

### III. HUMAN CAPITAL; HUMAN RESOURCES AND HUMAN DEVELOPMENT

1. Human capital theory
2. Human resource approach
3. Human development concept
4. Selecting the appropriate concept

### IV. HUMAN RESOURCE UTILIZATION AND REINTEGRATION

1. Identification and taxonomy of skills
  1. A broad view on human capabilities
  2. Applicability of acquired qualifications in civilian activities
  3. Skills for different labor markets and occupations
2. Application of skills and utilization of human resources
3. Policies for effective utilization of human resources after demobilization

### V. HUMAN RESOURCES DEVELOPMENT AND REINTEGRATION

1. Training for economic integration
  1. The impact of training
    1. Human development
    2. Economic development and productive value
  2. Training design for effective economic integration
    1. Is training the solution?
    2. Training needs analysis
  3. Target group selection and trainee specification
  4. Minimalist vs. multi-package approach
2. Training for social integration
  1. The impact of training
  2. Training design for effective social integration
3. Training modes and training systems
  1. The diversity of training systems: a review
  2. Implications for education and training policies

## VI. EVALUATION OF HUMAN RESOURCE MANAGEMENT

1. Cost-benefit analysis
  1. Benefits from effective human resource development and utilization
  2. Cost analysis of human resource management
  3. Value benefits and costs in monetary terms
2. Effectiveness study
3. Cost-effectiveness study
4. A modified cost-benefit approach
5. Selecting the appropriate evaluation methodology

## VII. CONCLUSIONS

## VIII. REFERENCES

## PREFACE

This paper is written as part of the ongoing BICC research project "Demobilization in Sub-Saharan Africa: the Socio-Economic and Security Impact," funded by the Volkswagen Foundation. In the past decade, several countries in Sub-Saharan Africa have conducted large-scale demobilizations, mostly following the termination of civil wars. These demobilization exercises create considerable opportunities for sustainable peace and human development. However, demobilization and the reintegration of ex-combatants into civilian life are complex processes, and their impact is not always (entirely) positive. Thus far, very limited research has been done to find out what their impact actually was.

This BICC research project will assess the development and security impact of demobilization in Sub-Saharan Africa, particularly focusing on Eritrea, Ethiopia, Mozambique and Uganda. It intends to show to what extent demobilizations have improved people's lives. The analysis will draw on several economic approaches, considering the financial as well as the human resources involved. The research is a cooperative effort by several researchers, at BICC and elsewhere, and will further BICC's broader work on issues related to post-conflict disarmament and development.

This paper, by Irmgard Nübler, is one of the contributions to the conceptual framework of the research. An earlier version of this paper was presented and discussed in a small seminar at BICC in September 1996. All comments on this paper, or the research project, are welcome.

For more information:

Kees Kingma, project leader  
BICC, An der Elisabethkirche 25, D-53113 Bonn, Germany  
tel: (49) 228-9119638, fax: (49) 228-241215  
E-mail: kingma@bicc.de

## I. INTRODUCTION

The ultimate objective of all demobilization and reintegration efforts should be to improve the welfare of people. At the same time, people and their capabilities are considered an important means and instrument in achieving the various economic, social and political objectives of the demobilization and reintegration process. Demobilization of combatants frees human potentials that can contribute to achieving these objectives if available skills and competence are used effectively and if people without any, or with only few skills are endowed with useful skills and qualifications. This paper will focus on human resource management of former combatants. Although ex-fighters are only one conflict-affected target group in post-conflict societies, there seems to be a consensus that (for various reasons) former fighters should receive special attention, in particular during the demobilization phase (BICC, 1996, p. 166).

Based on mainly economic theories and approaches, this paper develops a conceptual framework for analysis and assessment of effective utilization and development of human capabilities and resources during demobilization and reintegration. Chapter II identifies short, medium and long-term objectives of demobilization and reintegration. Policies in human resource management have to be analyzed and assessed in terms of these objectives.

Chapter III presents three different concepts-human capital, human resources and human development-which explain the relevance of human beings in development. The review shows that in the light of the objectives, the human resource approach represents an appropriate framework for analyzing the role of former soldiers and their capabilities during the demobilization and reintegration process.

Chapters IV and V discuss the relevance of human resource management in the context of demobilization and reintegration. The scarcity of resources available for demobilization and reintegration programs requires effective use of these resources. Chapter IV deals with effective utilization of ex-combatants' competencies. Interventions must first analyze competencies of ex-combatants which they may have acquired prior to recruitment or during military time. Second, to what extent these competencies are applicable and useful in civilian activities must be analyzed. Third, policy measures are required that facilitate the actual deployment and use of skills.

Chapter V addresses the development of human resources. Education and training can play an important role in facilitating economic and social integration which in turn contributes to political stability and security. The paper discusses the design of training programs for effective economic and social integration. In addition, the complexity and diversity of training systems and their implications for training policies are examined.

While the first chapters have focused on the analysis of human resource management, chapter VI deals with the evaluation of projects and policy measures aiming at effective human resource management. Several evaluation methodologies are presented which are examined in terms of their suitability and feasibility to evaluate human resource management interventions in demobilization and reintegration strategies.

## II. THE OBJECTIVES OF DEMOBILIZATION AND REINTEGRATION STRATEGIES

In general, the demobilization and reintegration process is related to a variety of objectives at the economic, social, political and human levels. The various objectives imply short, medium and long-term goals. This chapter highlights those objectives, in which utilization and development of human capabilities and resources are expected to play an important role. In light of the identified objectives, an appropriate concept is identified for the analysis of people's role during the demobilization process. Furthermore, measures, policies and projects in human resource management have to be evaluated in terms of these objectives.

The long-term objectives of the reintegration process are to enhance economic and human development (Kingma, 1995) and to foster and sustain political stability, security and peace. Collier and Pradhan (1994, p. 1, p. 119) argue that the removal of legitimate authority and the erosion of institutions of civil society make the consequences of civil war quite different from those of a conventional international war. "The longer a society stays in a state of civil war the more do conventions of legitimate conduct decay" (Collier and Pradhan, 1994, p. 120). They conclude that the restoration of peace is tightly linked to the reconstruction of systems of legitimacy. Boyce (1995, p. 2069) concludes that "... in the aftermath of a civil war, the "soundness" of policies can be ascertained only in the light of the political economy of the peace process."

A critical short and medium-term objective of demobilization strategies is to integrate ex-combatants into productive civilian life. Economic integration contributes to financial independence and self-reliance which is viewed as essential for achieving objectives of demobilization at the social and political level. Demobilized soldiers have to cope with an environment which is characterized by high rates of urban and rural unemployment or underemployment. In addition to the general employment situation in developing economies, wars negatively affect the level and composition of production and expenditures. The decline in productivity and aggregate output usually comes with a change in structure where resources are shifted to less productive activities, and expenditure is shifted out of investment and the public sector. Empirical evidence shows that production is shifted out of transaction-intensive, transaction providing and asset-vulnerable sectors. Consequently, subsistence agriculture expands most during the war, while market agriculture (including official exports) and manufacturing contract most severely (Collier and Pradhan, 1995). The recovery of production and the reversion of the structures to pre-war characteristics seems to be a slow process (Collier and Pradhan, 1994, p. 124). Consequently, employment opportunities emerge slowly. In the formal sector they are normally extremely limited in the short run. Engagement in the agricultural or informal sectors may be promising but lack of skills, capital, land or licenses and entrepreneurial experience may present constraints.

Another short and medium term objective is to integrate ex-combatants and their families into society. War-torn countries are characterized by fragmented societies. The fighter society has grown apart from civilian society, and the integration of both groups constitutes an important dimension of the demobilization process (Klingebiel et al., 1995). In addition, civil wars leave two irreconciled armies to be demobilized and united within one territory. Special target groups within the group of ex-combatants such as women fighters, child soldiers, disabled fighters, etc. need to be integrated socially. In the short term, social integration relates to the acceptance of the various groups by the host community and the willingness and chances of ex-combatants to integrate.

Human capital and human resources are expected to play a strategic role in post-conflict societies by contributing to the achievement of the short, medium and long-term objectives. Effective human resource management, i.e. the development and utilization of people's skills, knowledge and competence is considered a critical element of the demobilization process. The benefits from assistance and human resource policies may be very high. There is evidence that, in general, investment in human resource management is

efficient, i.e. the benefits outweigh the costs, and that the rates on investment in human capital are at least as high as in alternative uses (Psacharopoulos, 1988).

### III. HUMAN CAPITAL, HUMAN RESOURCES AND HUMAN DEVELOPMENT

The role and relevance of people in development may be analyzed by three different concepts - human capital, human resources and human development. Although these terms are sometimes used as synonyms, they refer to different concepts.

#### 1. Human capital theory

Human capital theory represents the neoclassical approach to the economics of education and training. It highlights the qualitative aspect of labor: "... human capital refers to the productive capacities of human beings as income producing agents in the economy" (Rosen, 1987, p. 681). According to Schultz (1961), human capital consist of health and of skills and knowledge, which have economic value. Human capital theory has focused mainly on the productive value of education and training. The relative neglect of health as a component of human capital reflects the fact, that until recently neoclassical labor economics have been directed mainly towards developed countries, where returns to incremental health are low. However, in developing countries, increments in health may result in high productive value and substantially increase the returns to education and training (Gill and Khandker, 1991, p.2)

The investment aspect is essential in the human capital theory. The acquisition of human capital through education and training is an investment in the sense that the individual foregoes current income for increased earnings potential in the future (McNabb, 1994, p. 3). "A sacrifice for the sake of learning today is rewarded tomorrow" (Psacharopoulos, 1988).

The theory of human capital is used to analyze the effects of human capital on productivity and income at the microeconomic and macroeconomic level. At the microeconomic level, human capital theory maintains that good health, knowledge and skills raise labor productivity, which in turn, influences economic activity and societal well-being. The acquisition of cognitive abilities, the formation of competence and the transfer of information are considered the major link between schooling/training and productivity (Bowman, 1980). The basic assumption of human capital theory, according to the general equilibrium theory, is that the wage rate is determined by the marginal productivity of the worker. Wage differentials between persons are explained in terms of their education and working experiences. The income difference is considered the return on investment in human capital.

At the macroeconomic level, new growth theories have formulated models to explain long-run growth of per-capita income by introducing human capital into the neoclassical growth model. The effect of human capital on growth is the enhancement of labor productivity. The increase in "effective labor" (or labor in efficiency units) provides permanent

incentives to accumulate production factors, thereby stimulating long-term growth of per-capita income (Lucas, 1988).

## 2. Human resource approach

Although many authors tend to use the term 'human resource' and 'human capital' synonymously, a closer look reveals substantial differences between these two approaches. First, the term 'human resources' includes both the quantitative (size of population, age structure) and qualitative aspects of human beings. Schultz (1961, p.8) maintains that "Human resources obviously have both quantitative and qualitative dimensions. The number of people, the proportion who enter upon useful work, and hours worked are ... quantitative characteristics. .... I shall neglect these and consider only such quality components as skill, knowledge and similar attributes that affect particular human capabilities to do productive work." This view point is also taken by Smith, Say, Mill, Bentham and List. "... labor is distinguished into mere physical exertion and the skill and mental power displayed in the exercise of the bodily act" (Bentham, quoted in Kiker, 1966, p. 487). In contrast, Walras, von Thünen and Fisher consider human beings as capital, which reflects the notion of human resources. Following Fisher's definition of capital, the skill of an individual is not capital in addition to the individual himself. "It is the skilled individual who should be placed in the category of capital." (Fisher, quoted in Kiker, 1966, p. 488).

Second, while human capital theory considers knowledge and cognitive skills the most important link to productivity, the human resource approach takes into account a variety of links between individuals' capabilities and their productivity. People are born with different talents and individual traits that may make them inherently more productive in certain occupations. The socialization and 'correspondence' approaches (Colclough, 1982) stress the role of non-cognitive or affective, as well as motivational and psychological dimensions of human resources in productivity. Education and training may have an important impact on a person's values, attitudes, norms (socialization effect), on motivation and expectations (psychological effects), and on behavior (McNabb, 1994, p. 6). These factors influence a human being's capacity as well as willingness to work effectively and are considered an important element of human resources.

Third, the human resource approach is oriented to the development as well as to the utilization of human resources. Human resource utilization is the extent to which available human resources are deployed effectively for the maximum achievement of individual, collective, organizational or national goals and objectives. Effective human resource utilization for development may involve human resource allocation, maintenance and further development (Kiggundu, 1989, p. 151). "Human resources ...constitute the ultimate basis for the wealth of nations... The goals of development are the maximum possible utilization of human beings in more productive activity and the fullest possible development of the skills, knowledge and capacities of the labor force ..." (Harbison, 1973, p. 3, 115).

Fourth, while human capital only refers to the productive value of people, the human resource approach refers to economic as well as political and social development

objectives. Human resource development and utilization are regarded as the means to meet basic human needs and to contribute to overall development by reducing fertility; by transmitting cultural, religious, political, and technological values; and by preserving national identity, cohesiveness and stability (Cohen, 1994, p.4).

### 3. Human development concept

The concept of human development is based on the ideas of A. K. Sen, designed by Mahbub ul Haq and promoted by UNDP. Sen defines development in terms of functionings achieved, "one of the functionings that may be thought to be particularly important in assessing the nature of development is the freedom to choose." (Sen, 1991, p.16). Human development is defined as enlarging people's choices, where the choices range from political, economic and social freedom to opportunities for being creative and productive, and enjoying personal self-respect and human rights (UNDP, 1990, p.15).

The human development concept is based on five essential ideas. First, human development becomes the real end of activities which moves people to center stage of development. Second, human development relates to the formation of human capabilities and the use people make of their acquired capabilities. Third, a distinction is made between ends and means. People are regarded as the ends, however, they are also means of development. Fourth, the human development concept embraces all of society. The political, cultural and social factors are given as much attention as economic factors. (Haq, 1995, p. 16).

Haq considers four essential components of human development and to each of them human resources are assigned an important role. The four pillars are equitable access to opportunities, sustainability of human opportunities, productivity and growth, and empowerment of people, meaning that people are placed in a position to exercise their own choices (Haq, 1995, p. 16 - 20). The level achieved on each of these pillars indicates the extent of people's economic, social, political and cultural choices.

The formation and utilization of human resources is regarded as one important policy measure to enhance the levels of the various pillars. Human resource development removes barriers that limit the access of women, minorities or other groups to key economic and political opportunities. Higher productivity and growth require investment in people and in human capital. Empowerment among many other factors requires investing in education and health so that people can take advantage of market opportunities as well as social and political opportunities and are able to participate in those activities, events and processes that shape their lives (Haq, 1995, p. 20).

### 4. Selecting the appropriate concept

An appropriate concept has to be selected for analyzing issues related to demobilization and reintegration of former combatants in Sub-Saharan Africa. The discussion of human capital, human resources and human development reveals that human capital theory takes a rather narrow view by focusing on human competencies for productive purposes. This

approach would mainly allow for the analysis of ex-combatants' contribution to income and productivity. The human resource approach takes a much broader view by relating to both the formation and utilization of human capabilities and to economic, social and political objectives. In fact, human capital may be considered as one facet in the human resource approach. Within the human resources framework a wide range of issues related to demobilization and reintegration may be analyzed. We can discuss the role of both effective utilization of capacities as well as education and training for ex-fighters. Human resource management can be linked not only to economic goals but also to social and political objectives. Furthermore, analysis of the relation between human resources and the various objectives of demobilization and reintegration is not restricted to the role of cognitive abilities, but may consider a broad range of variables such as different types of skills, motivation, expectations, ambitions, etc.

While the human capital and the human resource concept view human beings as a means, the human development concept highlights the dual role of people both as means and end of development. The human development approach, however, is not considered to be the most appropriate concept to analyze the role of ex-combatants in demobilization and reintegration. It represents a very comprehensive concept in which human resources are not the only means to achieve the human development objective. Other means of equal importance are the redistribution of productive assets (in particular land reform), the redistribution of income through progressive fiscal policy, voting rights reforms to equalize political opportunities, establishment of temporary social safety nets, etc. (Haq, 1995, p. 15). This approach is considered to be too broad for the nature of the given task. Furthermore, the human development approach still faces several weaknesses at the theoretical and conceptual level.

It is argued in this paper, that the human resource approach may in fact be considered as an integral part of the human development concept. Human capital and human resources represent one important element in human development strategies. Expanding people's choices constitutes the ultimate objective of development where choices relate to economic, political and social variables. Hence, the abstract variable human development is defined by economic, social and political dimensions. It has been pointed out that the human resource approach also relates to economic, social and political development goals. In this sense, human development, as the ultimate objective of development, sets the norms, goals and standards to be achieved by human resource management. The human resources concept provides the analytical framework.

One can conclude that the human resources approach represents the most appropriate and useful concept to discuss and analyze issues related to demobilization and reintegration of ex-combatants. The impact of the demobilization and reintegration process and the accompanying human resource policies, however, has to be ultimately assessed in terms of human development.

## IV. HUMAN RESOURCE UTILIZATION AND REINTEGRATION

Human resource utilization during demobilization and reintegration refers to the effective deployment of existing skills, qualifications and competencies of ex-combatants for the maximum achievement of individual, social, organizational or national goals and objectives of demobilization.

### 1. Identification and taxonomy of skills

An important first step in achieving effectiveness and efficiency in human resource management during demobilization and reintegration is to identify existing skills of former combatants. Qualifications, skills and competencies may be classified according to different criteria depending on the nature of the task to be performed.

#### 1.1. A broad view on human capabilities

Most studies on demobilization in African post-conflict countries tend to give a minor role to the aspect of utilization of existing skills. They conclude from surveys that most ex-combatants have very few or no skills and knowledge (ILO, 1995a, p. 1, 5, 11; Klingebiel et al., 1995, p. 24, 95; World Bank, 1993, p. 55). As a consequence, little consideration is given to effective utilization of existing competence and the focus is placed on human resource development.

Although little information is given on the methodology of data collection, it seems that data on existing skills is mainly collected in interviews, in which former combatants indicate what kind of skills they have acquired. The literature on empirical research methodologies discusses a range of reasons why the data obtained from self-reporting may not be reliable. In addition, it appears that a rather narrow view is taken in terms of skills variety. Reference is made implicitly to (formal) vocational, technical and basic general skills. The world of skills, however, is diverse. Human capabilities and competencies relate to knowledge, abilities, skills, values, attitudes and norms. These are the results of intentional learning, learning-by-doing, and the socialization process in the education and training system, as well as the employment system.

The development of human capabilities takes place at three levels: the cognitive, affective, and psychomotor levels. The cognitive area includes knowledge, understanding, problem solving and theory, and distinguishes between formal and idiosyncratic knowledge. Formal knowledge refers to knowledge and skills that can be transmitted in written or verbal instructions; the level of skills can be measured in exams or tests. Idiosyncratic knowledge is defined as "that intuitive knowledge, based upon training and experience, that is incapable of translation into written form" (Williamson, 1975, p. 35). Idiosyncratic experience is characteristic of many skills acquired while performing difficult tasks. During their work, people develop a task-specific know-how that is indispensable for doing a good job. Yet this know-how cannot be formalized and written into work instructions.

At the affective level human resource formation comprises emotions, attitudes, values and norms. Socialization effects such as punctuality, respect for authority, self-reliance, attitude towards work, and the ability to make decisions may be induced at the level of the family,

school or at work. Manual and practical skills including physical agility belong to the psychomotor area (Nölker and Schoenfeldt, 1985, p. 120).

Taking a broad view on skills and human competencies (and accounting for cognitive, affective and psychomotor skills), a more rigorous methodology may reveal some skills and qualifications in ex-combatants that can be of benefit to the individual and to society during demobilization.

## 1.2. Applicability of acquired qualifications in civilian activities

When people have acquired skills and qualifications during their military service, the central question is whether these skills can be transferred to civilian occupations. Hence, skills have to be distinguished into those which can be applied in civil occupations and those which are not transferable.

Two different concepts are presented which allow the distinction of skills in terms of transferability. One concept, which may be called the inter-occupational approach, distinguishes between functional and extra-functional qualifications. Functional or process-related qualifications relate to the performance, experience, knowledge and skills required for a particular type of job. Extra-functional or process-independent qualifications refer to technical and economic qualifications not tied to one very specific type of work. These include competencies such as the ability to cooperate and communicate, logical thinking, mastery of symbolic languages, technical understanding and creativity. In addition to economic qualifications, there are general and social qualifications such as diligence, attentiveness, thrift, responsibility, ability to adjust, flexibility and openness to life-long learning, change of social role, solidarity and opportunities for freedom of action (Nölker and Schoenfeldt, 1985, p. 160).

Extra-functional or key qualifications are transferable between different types of professions and therefore also transferable from the military to the civilian sector. Extra-functional qualifications may have been acquired during the time in the military at various levels. First, it is argued that training in the use of weapons and support equipment received by soldiers may induce changes at the affective level. Soldiers are supposed to acquire modern attitudes and aptitudes by working with modern machinery, following instructions, etc. (Ball, 1988). This attitude is considered to contribute to innovative behavior, adoption of new technologies and economic development (Inkeles and Smith, 1974).

Second, tolerance may be enhanced between people belonging to different ethnic groups or religions. In Eritrea, it was observed that there was a greater convergence of different viewpoints in the military than in civilian life. Experience of a high level of tolerance contributes to the social and political integration of demobilized soldiers (Klingebiel et al., 1995, p. 27).

Third, during their military time, many fighters may undergo a process of social transformation (Matthies, 1994, p. 93-95). There is evidence that people change from a rural to an urban mentality. Women fighters experienced a relationship to male fighters as

equals, and were very reluctant to return to their traditional roles in society, which were characterized by subordination to men. In many armed forces, woman fighters had equal rights and duties during the war and developed a high level of self-confidence. They were accepted and supported by the male fighters. This experience is expected to contribute in enhancing the level of equality in the whole society.

Finally, military service tends to enhance the ability to work in teams and to cooperate. Evidence from Eritrea shows that fighters are used to work in groups for many years at a time, which enhances their ability to cooperate. Group leaders have the opportunity to achieve competence in leadership. In Eritrea, former leaders are now serving in official bodies and are employing their skills to lead the country (Klingebiel et al., 1995, p. 26.).

A second concept that is useful in analyzing skills in terms of transferability from military to civilian sector has been introduced by Becker (1975). He distinguishes between specific and general skills of a particular occupation or job. Skills may be classified as either firm-specific or general skills. General training was defined as raising the worker's productivity in both the training firm and other firms. General skills, therefore, are useful in many firms and are transferable between firms or sectors. Becker defined specifically those forms of skill training which increase the productivity of a trainee in the firm providing the training, but which do not at all raise the worker's productivity in other firms. Most skills are neither completely general nor specific; the distinction, however, serves as a useful analytical tool.

In the context of military related skills, we define those skills as general which are applicable and useful in both the military and the civilian sectors. In contrast, military-specific or even weapon-specific skills are not useful in the civilian sector. Becker refers to the military sector as the producer of general skills. "The military offers some forms of training that are extremely useful in the civilian sector, ...for example, a machinist trained in the army finds his skills of value in steel and aircraft firms... ..and others that are only of minor use to civilians, i.e. astronauts, fighter pilots, and missile men. Such training falls within the scope of specific training because productivity is raised in the military but not (much) elsewhere." (Becker, 1975, p. 19, p. 26).

General skills of demobilized soldiers may have been acquired in the military at various levels through training and experience. Capabilities may be provided in basic skills such as reading and writing, in vocational and technical skills such as plumbing, printing, metalworking, learning to drive and repair vehicles, as well as at more advanced levels in electrical, chemical and mechanical engineering (Ball, 1988, p. 312). Military personnel may acquire skills in improved agricultural techniques since many armed forces in developing countries grow a portion of their own food. Training may also be provided in the health sector imparting medical expertise. Skills acquired during the performance of relatively less skilled non-occupational military tasks such as guard duty or proficiency in using weapons may still be of value in the civilian sector, for example in security services, in the police or as game wardens.

Ball concludes that some of the skills taught by the military can benefit the civilian sector, however, studies from industrialized countries suggest that transferability of military skills to the civilian sector is limited (Ball, 1988, p. 314). Although there is little evidence from African countries, it may be worth the effort to identify transferable skills. With respect to

former child combatants, however, the ILO concludes that "in no case studies on post-war countries in Africa were the children considered to have developed skills that could contribute to their reintegration" (ILO, 1995b, p. 21).

The concept of transferability suggests two types of general skills: those which are transferable between different professions, and those skills of a particular occupation, which are transferable between firms or sectors. It follows that extra-functional and skills identified as general (in contrast to firm-specific) are transferable from the military to the civilian sector, whereas military-specific skills are of little or no use in civilian occupations.

### 1.3. Skills for different labor markets and occupations

Policies for effective allocation of demobilized workers in the labor market and job placement measures, as well as policies to promote self-employment, require analysis of available skills according to their relevance in different labor market segments and occupations. Former combatants may be employed in the formal or informal sector as workers or as managers; they may start their own enterprise or work on their own farm. These different tasks and occupations require different patterns of skills and competencies. One can distinguish between vocational/technical, management and entrepreneurial skills.

Vocational and technical qualifications relate to those skills, knowledge and attitudes required for effective and efficient performance within an occupation or group of occupations. Different levels of vocational and technical skills can be identified. Semi-skilled workers have acquired the rudiments of a craft or trade, mainly informally or on-the-job. Skilled workers have skills of a journeyman at the level of job-readiness. Master craftsman skills reflect advanced theoretical and craft knowledge, enabling them to serve in the formal sector as supervisors and trainers of other employees. Technician is the highest level of skilled work, where the theoretical component of competency is greater than for skilled workers (ILO, 1986).

Vocational and technical skills may also be classified according to their relevance for a specific sector and be distinguished between industrial, commercial and agricultural skills. Some occupations however, such as secretary or auto mechanic are in demand across these sectors of employment and are not sector-specific.

Vocational skills can further be distinguished as skills for traditional and non-traditional or 'parallel' occupations (King, 1990). Traditional trades are confined to the informal sector and do not exist in the formal sector. Parallel trades refer to occupations which exist in both the formal and informal sectors. These skilled trades such as car mechanic, metalworker, carpenter, builder, or tailor may be acquired in traditional apprenticeship as well as in the formal sector. Obviously, skill identification among ex-fighters requires taking into account not only non-traditional, but also traditional skills such as knowledge on traditional healing methods or food processing.

Business management skills relate to the abilities required to operate an enterprise or a farm efficiently. These skills refer to the ability to use planning, monitoring and evaluation tools effectively, and to coordinate and control production for successful business performance. They also refer to abilities such as managing human relations within the firm, dealing with

public bureaucracy and managing customer and supplier relations. Management skills may be acquired through formal training, training on the job or learning by doing (Metcalf, 1984). Experience from small enterprise development programs shows that both vocational and management skills may be required for successful performance. Some studies assign a dominant role to management. Kilby (1988) considers the low capacity among small-scale entrepreneurs in African countries in performing day-to-day management functions to be a major constraint. Proponents of management training maintain that technically and vocationally skilled individuals who lack business management skills are more likely to experience difficulties in operating their business than someone with lower vocational skills but management ability (McLaughlin, 1990, p.104).

Entrepreneurial skills relate to the "ability to deal with disequilibria", i.e. the "efficiency of human beings to perceive, to interpret correctly, and to take action that will appropriately reallocate their resources" (Schultz, 1975, p.827). Entrepreneurial skills refer to abilities such as making investment decisions, innovating, imitating, and filling gaps in fragmented markets. Programs to assist ex-combatants in starting a micro-enterprise may in particular select those who possess entrepreneurial skills and provide management and vocational skills training.

Finally, occupational oriented distinction can be made between strategic and core skills (Benson, 1989). Strategic skills (or occupations) are skills that are in short supply, but are key complementary inputs to priority economic development strategies. Because both strategies and skills availability can differ, what is 'strategic' at any time in a given economy varies. Where the dominant strategy is expansion of the financial services sector, accountants, bookkeepers and computer operators may hold strategic occupations. Core skills are those occupational skills which are in demand across sectors. Many of these are traditional 'vocational' occupations such as secretary, electrician, craftsman, and auto mechanic. These skills are rarely critical to an economic growth area in the economy. Post-conflict societies may have opted for a particular development strategy implying the demand for certain strategic skills. Former combatants who have acquired such competencies should be identified in order to achieve an optimal utilization of these scarce skills.

## 2. Application of skills and utilization of human resources

When former combatants possess marketable skills, the important question is whether these competencies are actually applied in civilian occupations. Very little evidence is available as to the degree of the actual transfer of skills acquired in the military into civilian applications. Data on South Korea reveals that many skills acquired by soldiers were not utilized productively and therefore were of no benefit to the civilian economy. This case shows that even where the potential exists for transferring skills, the transfer may not happen automatically (Ball, 1988, p. 318).

Several preconditions are required for the actual use of skills. First, available skills of ex-fighters can only be used productively if there exists a demand for these skills, and employment opportunities are provided in the relevant occupations in the civilian sector. Second, the former soldiers must feel the motivation and incentive to work in the particular occupation. The process by which individuals decide to implement changes and to actually

utilize their capabilities is influenced by future expectations and past experience. The expectancy theory (Vroom, 1964) postulates that a certain action will take place as the result of behavior and the desire for a particular outcome. The outcome may relate to monetary or to non-monetary motivation since moral incentives such as recognition or work ethics can be as powerful as monetary motives (Prokopenko, 1989 p. 209, 212). Furthermore, the individual's previous history is assumed to play a significant role in the decision to change behavior, apply skills and make use of information (Campbell and Pritchard, 1976). The person's previous experience and performance on similar tasks in the past as well as the individual's level of self-esteem all influence the decision to implement changes and to use their skills.

Third, even where employment opportunities exist and former soldiers are motivated, various obstacles may prevent them from applying their skills. Individuals may have less control over their own behavior than they would like to have. The obstacles may be cultural attitudes or expected negative feed-back such as jealousy and resentment. Particularly for those who start their own enterprise, the lack of access to complementary resources such as credit and physical inputs, or legal constraints may be barriers. Ex-combatants looking for paid employment may lack job-search skills. There is evidence that veterans may find it very difficult to obtain information on available jobs and many are unaware of job opportunities (World Bank, 1993, p. 74).

Finally, complementary training may be required to facilitate the transfer of skills. There may be important differences even between similar occupations in military and civilian sector which mitigates against the easy transfer. Many civilian occupations, particularly in skilled trades, demand a much higher skill level than is required of a soldier in counterpart military occupations (Wool and Harold, 1968, p. 55-56, quoted in Ball, 1988, p. 304). A large part of the problem can be traced to essential differences between military jobs and their civilian counterparts. Skills and knowledge required may differ markedly because of differences in equipment, organization and methods. For example, a mechanic responsible for maintenance of an armored tank may not easily be equated with a civilian auto mechanic (Ball, 1988, p. 304).

In addition, the inadequacy of training received in the armed forces may prevent skills from being applied. Skills tend to be provided in short-term training, mainly limited to the basic level, and lacking a theoretical background. The emphasis is often on some practical skills and entirely directed to meet the needs of the military. As a consequence, utilization of skills acquired during military service may require complementary training.

### 3. Policies for effective utilization of human resources after demobilization

Effective utilization of existing skills, abilities and competencies requires supportive policies and complementary measures helping former soldiers to make use of their skills in civilian life. These measures, interventions and policies refer to both the supply and demand side of the labor market.

On the supply side of the labor market, skill verification for former soldiers who have acquired marketable skills, enhances their competitiveness. In Ethiopia, for example,

certificates were issued to those who had acquired skills during military service. Certification of skills would provide information to potential employers on the person's type and level of experience. The certification should be done in such a way as to ensure credibility in the private sector (Colletta et al., 1996, p. 16).

Job placement and counseling programs may help veterans find existing jobs. It appears that few of the governments in African post-conflict countries have established formal mechanisms for assisting veterans finding employment in the private sector (World Bank, 1993, p. 74). Furthermore, there is evidence that the ambitions, aspirations and preference patterns of ex-fighters cannot always be met by opportunities. Counseling can assist individuals in becoming aware of and accepting the limitations, adjusting preferences to opportunities, and taking initiatives.

On the demand side of the labor market, the issue of creating jobs must be faced where jobs are unavailable. The economic situation in conflict-affected countries is generally not conducive to employment, making the total employment task a challenge. On top of that, structural adjustment and economic reform programs implemented by governments in many post-conflict countries tend to increase unemployment, at least in the short-term. Programs to create jobs and paid employment for a large number of ex-combatants may in particular be created in employment-intensive infrastructure construction and rehabilitation (ILO, 1995d, p. 8). Furthermore, self-employment in small and micro-enterprises is considered an important option in creating income opportunities to a large number of demobilized soldiers within a short period of time. (ILO, 1995d, p. 9). Those who plan to start their own enterprise may require access to complementary inputs such as basic management and/or vocational training, counseling, credit, land, equipment, etc. Business opportunity identification surveys are very important in matching the preferences of the combatants with market opportunities. Little attention appears to be given to business opportunity studies during the demobilization process. Consequently, the choice of small enterprise activities made by the ex-combatants appeared to be only weakly related to market opportunities (ILO, 1995e, p. 23).

These measures involve costs and require funding. If they contribute successfully in utilizing available qualifications and competence, the benefits to the demobilization process may be substantial. Effective utilization of human resources contributes to economic integration and rehabilitation of the economy, to social reintegration and the peace-building process. It is essential to manage available human resources effectively, to assist in job placement and to facilitate direct employment creation or increase the ability of demobilized combatants for self-employment.

## V. HUMAN RESOURCES DEVELOPMENT AND REINTEGRATION

Formation of human resources is expected to play an essential role in achieving the objectives of the demobilization process in post-conflict societies. The importance of training is recognized in most reintegration strategies (ILO, 1995a; ILO, 1995b; Srivastava, 1995). Most education and training for ex-combatants aims at facilitating economic and social integration. Training may address former combatants who have very few or no

marketable skills. Refresher or up-grading courses may be provided to those who had been trained prior to military service or training may assist ex-combatants complementing skills acquired during military service. Special attention should be given to the initial training needs of former children fighters and young ex-combatants. This target group is in particular need of education and vocational training since most had no access to school and lack vocational and professional opportunities (ILO, 1995c, p. 21).

Post-conflict training strategies should also be developed with an eye on meeting long-term needs of national development. In most countries, unemployment and underemployment exist side by side with a shortage of skilled workers, middle and higher level technicians, and professionals (Srivastava, 1995, p. 19). In particular, strategic skills, which are required for the successful implementation of development strategy in the economy, should be developed.

## 1. Training for economic integration

A major short and medium-term objective of human resource development in the demobilization process is to integrate ex-combatants into productive civilian life. Training aims at endowing ex-combatants with relevant skills, knowledge and information so that they will be able to find productive employment or start and manage successfully a micro-enterprise or a small farm.

### 1.1. The impact of training

The analysis of the process by which participation in training programs is transmitted into benefits allows for an impact at the level of the individual, the enterprise and the economy.

#### 1.1.1. Human development

Training may have a strong impact at the level of the individual since it creates human capabilities and competencies. Human capabilities are created in individuals at the cognitive, affective and motivational levels. Human capital theorists highlight the relevance of increased cognitive abilities (Becker, 1975). Affective effects of education and training are related to important socialization effects shaping attitudes, values, norms and behavior. Finally, training may have a strong impact in the psychological and motivational domain (McClelland, 1961). The training event itself and the fact of being selected and given attention may induce substantial motivation in participants.

The development of these various capabilities and competencies in former combatants constitutes one important side of human development. Human capabilities help to remove barriers to economic, social and political opportunities (Haveman and Wolfe, 1984), and to foster empowerment so that ex-fighters can take advantage of existing opportunities and participate in those events and processes shaping their lives.

### 1.1.2. Economic development and productive value

The development of human capabilities and their effective use results in economic effects which are highly desirable in post-war developing countries. First, individual competence is positively related to the physical productivity and technical efficiency of labor in production. It enables the worker, the manager of a firm or a farmer to produce more output with given quantities of input through the efficient use of given resources (Jamison and Mook, 1984, p. 68). Welch (1970, p. 42) labels these the "worker effect". Leibenstein (1988) maintains that the ability to fill gaps and complete inputs play an important role in achieving technical efficiency. Developing countries, and in particular post-war societies are characterized by an environment where goods and factor markets are not well established and where relevant aspects of the production technologies and processes are not completely known. Relevant training improves the ability of entrepreneurs to cope with fragmented markets, to promote product quality and maintenance which results in higher technical efficiency.

Second, human capabilities contribute to higher allocative efficiency. It helps the manager in allocating the firm's or farm's resources in a cost-efficient manner, choosing which outputs and how much to produce, and in what proportions to use inputs in production (Jamison and Mook, 1984, p. 68). Welch (1970 p. 42) calls it the "allocative effect" of education and training. The allocative or entrepreneurial capacity (see chapter IV, 1.3) is of little value in static societies. However, when changes in economic conditions occur and disequilibria arise, the allocative ability has high productive value. Consequently, these abilities tend to be highly relevant in post-conflict countries which undergo dramatic economic and social changes (Schultz, 1975, p. 827).

Third, human resources formation tends to have positive effects on the supply of entrepreneurial activity and enhances the capacity and the willingness to invest, innovate and imitate by applying new discoveries and ideas. The availability of technical skills is an important factor in technology choice and utilization in a firm. Furthermore, since employment opportunities in post-conflict countries are rare, most ex-combatants have to turn towards self-employment in the informal sector. In order to start a small enterprise, individuals must be motivated, have a positive attitude toward self-employment and should possess entrepreneurial and managerial capacities. These variables tend to be positively related to training.

Finally, job mobility and the ability to move into higher productivity sectors and occupations are related to the level of qualification. Sectoral and regional mobility are particularly important in countries under transformation and adjustment, since this situation requires the reallocation of resources-including human resources. Those individuals, who are endowed with marketable skills increase their employability. They will be more flexible in adjusting to changes in economic structures and can take advantage of employment opportunities.

### 1.2. Training design for effective economic integration

In order to be effective, training has to be based on training needs analysis, give careful attention to the selection, specification and particular needs of the trainees, and to consider the role of additional assistance.

### 1.2.1. Is training the solution?

Training may be a solution in achieving economic integration of ex-combatants. However, not all problems can be solved through an increase in the level of skills and knowledge. Analysis must demonstrate and identify the role for training as part of the solution to a given problem. Usually, the supply of skilled labor does not create its own demand. Pre-employment training for entry into the formal sector and the large supply of vocationally trained graduates in many developing countries resulted in high rates of graduate unemployment, underemployment and low rates of human resource utilization where other factors and conditions were not present (Lauglo and Närman, 1988; Mingat et al., 1989). Consequently, training of ex-combatants for direct employment has to be based on labor market studies and should be strictly demand driven (ILO, 1995d, p. 11).

Training for self-employment in the informal sector requires analysis of markets. Feasibility studies must demonstrate potentials for self-employment. If there is a market, training aiming at facilitating entry into self-employment can be effective (McLaughlin, 1989; Boomgard, 1989).

### 1.2.2. Training needs analysis

Once a role for training is identified, the specific training needs have to be analyzed. Training needs analysis involves three steps. First, the skill requirements of occupations or tasks have to be analyzed. A failure to review occupational practices can result in over-training, under-training or irrelevant training and result in ineffective use of available resources. Second, the level and extent of existing skills among former combatants need to be identified. Relevant knowledge levels and qualifications can be identified through aptitude tests, interviews or recruitment procedures. Third, the skills and standards inherent in the training need have to be identified. An effective training prescription is necessary to successfully attain this goal.

Inadequate planning of training without hard data on needs and market demand is cited as a major problem in several post-conflict countries. When skills training programs started in Ethiopia, there was insufficient time to make advance plans for training based on market demand. It was originally planned that a survey would be conducted to determine the training needs of demobilized soldiers reintegrating in urban areas. However, this could not be done due to time constraints (ILO, 1995a, p. 15).

### 1.3. Target group selection and trainee specification

Effectiveness requires that participants of training programs apply what has been learned. Therefore, training should be provided to those who demonstrate a positive long-term

aptitude in the practice of the particular skills. This represents an attempt to avoid wasting resources on participants who successfully complete their training program, but either become dissatisfied with the subsequent occupation, leave or never take up the occupation at all.

Training programs for small enterprise development have to ensure that only those ex-combatants are selected who are motivated to start their own business. In this context, it is important that training is the only motivation to participate in training courses. Some programs pay training allowances where participation in training seminars may become profitable. Paying training allowances may contribute to attracting the wrong people with low motivation resulting in low effectiveness.

The design of training programs has to be attuned to the socioeconomic and educational characteristics of the targeted ex-combatants. Trainees with little formal knowledge and literacy skills need specific teaching methods and much more attention may be focused on the motivational and psychological aspects of training. Women ex-fighters tend to face gender-specific obstacles and constraints both in finding employment and in self-employment. They tend to have little access to knowledge, skills, information, and resources. Gender-differentiated use of time gives them less flexibility, as they face social and cultural restraints on productivity and limited access to higher income-generating activities. Training programs should address these issues and take constraints into account in their design. In addition, the scheduling of training programs should consider time constraints of women due to their multiple tasks.

Studies on demobilization programs in African countries conclude that the short-term approach adopted in the reintegration programs resulted in a lack of coordinated programs for special groups of demobilized combatants such as women, children and disabled persons. Studies on Uganda and Mozambique view the lack of attention to the needs of various target groups a major shortcoming in demobilization strategies (ILO, 1995a).

#### 1.4. Minimalist vs. multi-package approach

Training alone may not always be effective. Additional assistance may be required in order to achieve effectively the objectives of training. Pre-employment training may require further assistance to ensure successful transfer between training and work. Job placement or counseling may be important in particular after institution based training, where vocational education is not aimed at meeting specific employment needs of particular organizations.

There is evidence that training micro-entrepreneurs in management skills may be rather effective when the objective is to improve performance of an existing enterprise. However, if the objective is to start an enterprise or to transform into higher value added products, training alone may not be very effective. Start-up programs tend to require a complex package including technical and management training, credit, technical assistance, etc. This is in particular important, when programs address disadvantaged pre-entrepreneurs without access to resources (McLaughlin, 1989).

The majority of demobilized combatants will have to turn to self-employment in the informal sector. Training programs to assist in small and micro-enterprise creation during the reintegration process may require complementary assistance. At the same time, however, the assistance package should not be too complex for two main reasons. First, the costs may become very high resulting in low cost-effectiveness. Second, implementing organizations may have difficulties in handling complex packages which also contributes to low cost-effectiveness of programs (Tendler, 1989).

## 2. Training for social integration

Most studies discuss education, training and work experience in the context of economic integration. The previous discussion on human resources and human development (see chapter III) has shown that education and training is more than endowing people with marketable skills for productive purpose. The formation of human capabilities and the training process itself may induce many favorable effects which are highly desirable after demobilization.

### 2.1. The impact of training

Training is expected to contribute to social integration of former combatants in different ways. First, the possession of skills that are of immediate appreciable value to the community, and the capacity and willingness to work, will facilitate acceptance of former combatants by the community and foster social integration in the family and community.

Second, training facilitates social integration through its socialization effect. In many cases the ex-combatants spent many years in combat and have been socialized according to military rules and hierarchical structures. Attending schools or participating in training allows the former soldiers to learn or relearn norms and practices of civilian society (ILO, 1995b, p. 22). This is particularly true for ex-child soldiers. They have often lost cultural values, which is very serious given that they were in the crucial stages of development. Training is therefore considered an important element of programs for their rehabilitation and social integration. Such action "is part of a process in the life of the child, and not something 'done' to the child that can be separated from his/her experience in the military or prior to recruitment, or from the present situation." (ILO, 1995b, p. 8).

Ex-combatants, having served in the military for many years, have been socialized according to these principles. Military training makes soldiers follow orders without asking too many questions. As a consequence they often tend to be reluctant to seek explanations or participate actively in demobilization and reintegration programs. In Zimbabwe, training in participatory approaches to planning and decision-making was provided, helping ex-soldiers to overcome this attitude (ILO, 1995a).

Third, training helps in finding a new identity and empowerment. Training settings can contribute to developing a sense of identity that is not linked to the previous roles in the military. Education and vocational training can do a lot to build self-confidence and respectability, to redirect the individual's energy in useful ways and to build hope for the

future (ILO, 1995b, p. 25). Furthermore, training can be therapeutic and helps to reduce trauma caused by the loss of family members and friends. Ex-soldiers begin to recover from their experiences, and find a new identity during the training process and through meaningful and productive activities.

Finally, regaining lost education and training opportunities avoids frustration among ex-combatants and facilitates integration. Freedom fighters fought for their ideals and often built up great expectations beyond victory (Klingebliel, et al., 1995, p. 5). They may be easily frustrated when changes and possibilities do not occur as they had expected and feel bitter and betrayed. In particular, they may become disappointed about their restricted economic opportunities when looking at the more qualified people who have fled the country or stayed behind and were able to continue their education and training. In addition, formal education requirements may deny the uneducated ex-soldier access to training courses. Consequently, effective integration will be affected by the opportunities to regain lost education and access to training.

## 2.2. Training design for effective social integration

Training for social integration is assumed to be most effective when it is provided in mainstream programs and when training is linked to the working world. First, social integration of special groups is enhanced when training is not provided in separate courses, but rather in mainstream programs. Studies on training for women (Jennings, 1988; Goodale, 1989), former children fighters (ILO, 1995b) as well as training for disabled persons (ILO, 1995c) strongly suggest not to treat these groups as a distinct or separate group in programs for vocational training, but rather place them into skills courses with other trainees. This will ensure their assimilation and acceptance and will work towards conflict resolution. Vocational training is seen as an integral component of social reintegration, and efforts should be made to avoid marginalization (ILO, 1995c; ILO, 1995b). Furthermore, training in mainstream programs avoids ex-combatants being perceived as privileged by the receiving community which is considered important for successful integration (BICC, 1996, p. 166).

Nevertheless, demobilized groups have particular experiences and they may have special needs. These particular needs will have to be addressed outside of mainstream programs. There may also be a case for separate training when young ex-combatants hesitate to attend school classes with much younger children or where attitude towards education is very negative (ILO, 1995b, p. 21). A study from Uganda reports that civilian schools were reluctant to accept former child soldiers and they expressed reservations that they could manage the behavior of the children (ILO, 1995b).

Second, training enhances social integration when it is linked to work. The needs of former soldiers not only for vocational training per se, but also for basic education and training in life skills is best met when training is not provided in isolation. Education with production is a model where education is linked to productive life to create a foundation for adult life, providing better opportunities for former child soldiers to integrate with other children and allowing the young soldiers to relearn the norms and practices of civil society in a natural and progressive manner.

Apprenticeship provides the opportunity for young people to be trained by craftspeople and local entrepreneurs, and in some cases even become members of the family for the duration of the training. In particular, traditional apprenticeship is open to most young people and activities are relevant to the local situation (Fluitman, 1989). The pedagogue Kerschensteiner (1926) has already stressed the positive impact of vocational training (particularly apprenticeship training) on a person's attitude towards his occupation and on the development of his character.

Family based training is carried out within the family to enable the children to learn skills traditionally associated with providing for the family's economic security. This provides an opportunity to support existing income-generating skills and improves the family's capacity to care for the child (ILO, 1995b, p. 23).

One can conclude that those training settings tend to be most effective in assisting in social integration which avoid marginalization of special groups and isolated training. Hence, training should be provided in mainstream programs and work-related settings whenever possible.

### 3. Training modes and training systems

The world of training is vast and complex. Human resources are created by education, training, learning-by-doing and other experiences. In every society one generation passes know-how, information and skills to the next, however in different modes. Consequently, country-specific education and training modes have developed by which both general and vocational knowledge and skills are passed on via formal, non-formal, informal and traditional channels. Education and training systems reflect a society's preference for certain modes of skills and knowledge transfer. Policies for human resource development after demobilization should consider all available modes and should not restrict their attention to the formal education and training modes.

#### 3.1. The diversity of training systems: a review

Training systems in developing countries encompass a variety of different training modes which may be institutional or enterprise based and may be provided both in the formal and the informal sector (see box 1). The different training modes provide either pre-employment training (initial training) to young adults, or they provide continuous and retraining to adults with working experience. Training may last a few weeks or may take several years. Some training modes tend to provide skills mainly for formal sector jobs in production, administration or planning at various levels in the private or public sector, while others equip with skills for informal employment or self-employment both in traditional and non-traditional occupations. The formal training modes have entry requirements and therefore may only be accessed by students with formal skills while access to traditional training modes may be regulated via family, ethnic or other ties.

### 3.2. Implications for education and training policies

The diversity and complexity of training systems has three important implications. First, the various training modes differ substantially in terms of training outcomes, skill levels, quality of training, financing and expectations. Consequently, each mode has different implications for effectiveness and efficiency. Those modes should be promoted that are effective in terms of objectives of demobilization and that are efficient in terms of costs and outcomes.

Second, different countries have had success with different strategies for transferring occupation-specific skills to the work force. The cost-effectiveness of different methods of acquiring skills depends on many country-specific factors. As a consequence, the effects of a particular training mode may differ between countries.

#### Box 1: Education and training modes

Institutional based education and training in the formal and informal sector relate to the following modes:

Pre-school institutes like nursery, kindergarten, etc. where children are actively promoted by learning practical and useful skills and developing their motor skills. They acquire substantial knowledge and important social and learning competencies.

General basic and secondary education in formal school system under the Ministry of Education.

Vocational education in formal secondary school systems under the Ministry of Education.

Training in public and private formal institutes and centers under the Ministries of Labor, Economic Affairs, Technology and Science, etc. In most African societies the number receiving formal training in schools or training centers is very small in comparison to the multitude of workers who have acquired their occupational skills in the non-formal or informal training system.,

Publicly and privately financed post secondary technical schools providing advanced education and training at the technician level in a wide range of occupations (Polytechnics, technical institutes, junior college, etc.).

Training in non-formal courses and extension schemes (outside the formal school system and not leading to formal qualifications) such as training provided by NGOs, in Koran schools, etc. Non-formal education and training typically concentrates on short programs of a few months in duration. NGOs cover a wide variety of training such as adult literacy programs, agricultural extension schemes, community development, and handicraft training thus playing a significant role in wider domestic, health and civic education programs

Courses at private backstreet colleges in the informal sector. These are privately owned and profit-making institutes where anyone who can afford the fee can attend (King, 1990). Courses may range from traditional skills such as tailoring, to computer or accounting skills.

Enterprise based training in the formal and informal sector relates to the following training modes:

Formal apprenticeship (mostly under the Ministry of Labor) provides initial training to young people. Training is provided on the job by experienced trainers. Regulations establish the curriculum that employers must follow in order to ensure broad occupational training. Supervision, testing and certification are required .

Non-formal on-the-job training to provide the skills needed to manage a certain task or to complement physical capital in project investment. The training has typically narrow objectives.

Traditional apprenticeship in informal sector enterprises. Historically, this is the principal means of skills acquisition and is widely practiced in developing countries. Individuals apprentice themselves to a master, surrendering their labor in return for training on-the-job, often for five or more years. An initial training fee may be charged and apprentices may receive food, lodging, and later on a small allowance.

Family based skills transfer where traditionally mothers transmit skills and know-how to their daughters to a large extent in skills which are an extension of their household and domestic responsibility. Craft skills like glass blowing, bronze casting, metal engraving, etc. are traditionally passed from father to son and strictly guarded (Goodale, 1987).

Third, the decision makers are presented with a very wide range of options if new challenges in human resource formation are to be met. The task is to develop and adjust the training system so that it meets social and economic needs effectively. Change and adjustment in training systems tend to be more feasible and effective when they build incrementally from the current base of policy and institutions (Nübler, 1991). In order to meet the training challenges during the post-war period, expanding existing facilities is suggested before establishing new institutions. In many post-conflict countries, it will be necessary to rebuild and rehabilitate training facilities damaged during the war. The reintegration of demobilized combatants offers the opportunity to expand and rehabilitate the training system, to introduce changes in order to increase effectiveness and efficiency by introducing market orientation, curriculum reform, flexible entry requirements and better capacity utilization, and to develop a comprehensive training system.

## VI. EVALUATION OF HUMAN RESOURCE MANAGEMENT

Human resource management devotes scarce resources to measures such as general and vocational education, formal or informal training, job placement, skills verification and

certification, counseling, job creation and assistance in establishing a micro-enterprise. The scarcity of resources available for demobilization and development assistance poses high opportunity costs on any particular intervention. Projects chosen should be most effective in terms of objectives and should achieve efficiency in terms of costs and benefits.

Studies on demobilization and reintegration highlight the fact that benefits, costs and effectiveness of interventions and projects are hardly evaluated (1). Reasons for the lack of project evaluations may be time pressure, lack of funds, lack of experts to undertake the evaluation studies, or methodological or practical difficulties. Projects are evaluated, if at all, in terms of money spent as predicted or program implemented as planned. It is simply assumed or hoped that implementation will bring the expected benefits to the target group.

The human resource management projects implemented during the demobilization and reintegration phase in post-conflict countries may be evaluated with different methodologies. This chapter presents several evaluation approaches and discusses their appropriateness.

### 1. Cost-benefit analysis

Cost-benefit analysis evaluates projects and interventions in order to measure their profitability by comparing costs and benefits where both are measured in monetary terms (Levin, 1983, p. 21). In principle, cost-benefit studies can be performed at the private, corporate and social level, measuring costs and benefits to the individual, to the implementing enterprise or organization, and to society, respectively (Metcalf, 1984, p. 96).

Cost-benefit analysis involves four steps. First, the project's relevant costs and benefits must be identified. Economic benefits can be defined as all goods and services made available to the economy by the effect of a project or intervention. Direct benefits occur to the immediate users of the project's output, while indirect benefits, or positive external effects, refer to the outcome of a project such as spillover effects or the creation of further employment. These indirect effects result in a net gain to society, but not to a direct gain to the individuals who acquire the project's output (Dasgupta et al., 1972, p. 64). In addition to the economic benefits, additional objectives of a society such as equity or environmental objectives may be achieved by the intervention which, in principle, should be identified and specified.

Costs are treated in analogy to benefits. They are defined in terms of opportunity costs, which is the maximum alternative benefit foregone. By devoting resources to a particular use, society has to sacrifice the benefits that could be obtained from using them for other purposes (costs are defined as sacrificed benefits and therefore benefits with a negative sign). The net benefit (benefits minus costs) is defined as " ... all goods and services made available to the economy that would not have been available in the absence of the project." (Dasgupta et al., 1972, p. 40).

In a second step, costs and benefits must be given a value in order to be comparable. Market prices are used to assess a private investor's prospects and social prices to assess the project from society's point of view. Third, costs and benefits must be compared over time

by discounting those occurring in future periods. Finally, benefits have to be related to costs so that different projects can be compared (Roemer and Stern, 1974, p.24). Different evaluation criteria may be applied such as pay-out period, benefit-cost ratio, net present value or the internal rate of return to investment (Roemer and Stern, 1974, p.32).

### 1.1. Benefits from effective human resource development and utilization

Effective human resource management may induce a variety of social effects at the human, economic, social and political levels which are highly desirable in a post-conflict country since they contribute directly to the short, medium and long-term objectives of demobilization strategies.

Formation and effective use of human resources results in enhanced economic development and productive value by increasing allocative and technical efficiency, increasing the supply of entrepreneurial activities and fostering the willingness and ability to invest, innovate and imitate, and by enhancing the ability to move into higher-productivity sectors and occupations (see chapter V for details).

Furthermore, effective human resource management also contributes to achieving social objectives such as reduced inequality through the employment and income effect when equal opportunities are opened. Furthermore, social integration and cohesion of various groups of societies with different socioeconomic, religious, and cultural background is positively affected. Equal access to education and training as well as access to employment opportunities for each of these groups are considered essential in this context.

Providing ex-combatants with effective and well-designed education and training for rural employment either as farmers, as farm workers, or as rural micro-entrepreneurs will hopefully motivate former combatants to stay in their rural community instead of migrating to urban areas. Reduced rural-urban income differences and employment (or self-employment) opportunities will contribute to a better balance between rural and urban development.

These economic and social effects are considered critical in terms of political stability, security and peace. In the long-term, economic, social, and political effects of human resource development and utilization will foster the human development process.

### 1.2. Cost analysis of human resource management

Private cost analysis refers to costs borne by the trainee and his family or by an organization or enterprise, whereas social cost analysis includes all costs incurred on society. Social costs can be distinguished as direct, indirect or additional costs. Analysis of the direct costs of the project starts with the "net input" defined as "the goods and services withdrawn from the rest of the economy that would not have been withdrawn in the absence of the project" (Dasgupta et al., 1972, p. 53). Hence, in order to determine the relevant net input, those goods and services that suffer a net decline in availability have to be identified.

Cost components of human resource management programs typically relate to labor costs, facilities, equipment and materials. Small enterprise development programs may require credit, machines, access to imported inputs, etc. Individuals may bear such costs as transport (Levin, 1983, p. 52). An important cost element is the productive value foregone as a consequence of the intervention. Ex-combatants who undergo training are not available for productive work and therefore may incur a loss of earnings. Furthermore, in many African countries soldiers in civil wars tend to be engaged in a variety of activities in agriculture, production and services. The value that soldiers have produced during military time reflects the opportunity costs of demobilization. In addition, contributed or donated resources, such as volunteer personnel, must be included. Costs that would have incurred even without the intervention should not be included, but only the incremental costs induced by the project (for example, food for trainees).

All resources should be identified and included that are required to produce the benefits that will be captured in the evaluation. The degree of specificity and accuracy in listing cost components should depend upon their overall contribution to the total cost of the intervention. The most effort should be devoted to those components that are likely to dominate the cost picture

In addition to direct costs, indirect costs of the intervention may be identified. Indirect costs may occur through crowding out effects. Demobilized soldiers finding employment may simply substitute employed labor. Training to assist in small enterprise development increases performance of participants, but may reduce the income of competitors. Such negative external effects would substantially reduce the net benefits.

Additional costs may incur when further socioeconomic objectives such as equity and income distribution are affected in a negative way. This would be the case when funds are withdrawn from projects targeting low income groups. Employment creating projects such as construction of physical infrastructure may induce costs by negatively affecting the natural environment or by consuming irreversible natural resources.

Some indirect and additional costs of projects may be very difficult to identify, quantify and value. Dasgupta et al. (1972, p.67) maintain that such evaluations are not always worth making since errors due to inaccurate measures may be greater than the errors that result from neglecting certain indirect effects. They conclude that "it is far better ... to acknowledge that external effects may well be important even though we may not be able to quantify them."

### 1.3. Value benefits and costs in monetary terms

The main difficulties in cost-benefit analysis are converting all relevant benefits and costs into monetary terms. Traditional cost-benefit analysis restricts evaluation to tangible and quantifiable indicators (Roemer and Stern, 1974, p. 15). Valuing the benefits and costs of human resource formation and utilization tends to be much more complicated. In the framework of the human capital concept, the economic contribution of education and training is usually measured in terms of labor market outcomes. Indicators relate to

earnings at the individual level and to increased profit at the enterprise level (Metcalf, 1984). There are, however, some critical issues at the theoretical, empirical and methodological level in applying earnings and profits as indicators for measuring the benefits of education and training programs (Maglen, 1994). At the theoretical level, the most critical assumption is that market wages truly reflect marginal productivity, implying labor markets to operate under competitive conditions. In particular, in developing countries, most observers agree that wage differentials between different categories of labor are much greater than can be explained merely by productivity differences.

In addition, in an informal sector or in small scale agriculture, it may be extremely difficult to obtain reliable data on income and profit. Most micro-entrepreneurs or farmers do not apply monitoring and evaluating tools such as bookkeeping. Therefore, data on business performance can hardly be provided at reasonable cost, due to the lack of written records.

It is even more difficult to place a monetary value on non-economic benefits and costs. The specification of benefits has shown that training results in empowerment of people which contributes to human development. These effects can hardly be valued in monetary terms. In addition, there are no fully acceptable methods of determining the monetary value to society of less tangible effects such as social integration and cohesion, nation-building, reduced inequality, increased security or political stability. In the light of the theoretical, empirical and methodological difficulties of valuing all costs and benefits in monetary terms, traditional cost-benefit analysis does not appear to be the most appropriate evaluation methodology for human resource management projects in post-conflict countries.

## 2. Effectiveness study

The effectiveness approach aims at assessing the degree to which a program affects variables of interest (Stone, 1982, p. 94). In contrast to cost-benefit analysis, the effectiveness approach is objective and target oriented. Success or failure of a human resource management project is assessed by the extent to which given objectives and goals have been achieved. This approach does not require placing monetary value on benefits.

Effectiveness studies involve three steps. First, the variables of interest, i.e. the objectives of interventions have to be determined. In the context of demobilization and reintegration, the relevant objectives of human resource management programs may be economic integration, social integration, political stability, social rehabilitation, economic rehabilitation and human development. These objectives are abstract variables which are not directly measurable. Since empirical research can only deal with observable and operational variables, indicators have to be identified which can validly index the degree of success in terms of objectives.

Second, a construct has to be defined which allows the identification of appropriate and workable indicators. The analysis of benefits (in section 1 of this chapter) provides an appropriate framework and approach for identification of indicators. Indicators for evaluating effectiveness of training for micro-entrepreneurs may relate to the level of

competence achieved, the extent to which enterprises are established, employment created, business performance, etc.

Third, effectiveness has to be assessed by quantifying the degree to which standards of success or failure have been achieved. The evaluation study has to make sure that the effects observed were caused by the intervention. In other words, the research design has to ensure that the outcomes measured are the 'true' program effects, and that observed changes, which are in fact caused by other factors, are not taken as program effects (Stone, 1982). Control groups and a pre-test/post-test design comparing the observation of chosen indicators before and after the intervention imply a rather high degree of validity. The strength of the effectiveness approach is that it evaluates the success of human resource management programs directly in terms of a variety of objectives. However, it does not consider costs.

### 3. Cost-effectiveness study

The cost-effectiveness study combines the effectiveness study with costs. It usually starts from one particular objective or goal and compares several alternative projects. Cost-effectiveness studies involve three steps. First, the intervention's objective has to be determined, together with an appropriate indicator to measure effectiveness in terms of the objective. Second, the effectiveness data of several alternatives have to be compared with their costs in order to provide a cost-effectiveness evaluation. Third, the alternative has to be selected, which provides the maximum effectiveness per level of cost or which requires the least cost per level of effectiveness (Levin, 1983, p. 115).

Cost-effectiveness studies consider both costs and outcomes of the intervention. In contrast to cost-benefit analysis, cost-effectiveness studies free the evaluator from many requirements and methodological problems by enabling a more direct measure of impact in terms of the effectiveness of the intervention (Levin, 1983, p.42). The outcome does not need to be converted into monetary values and therefore permits the assessment of the outcomes in their own terms. In the context of demobilization and reintegration, training programs endowing unemployed ex-combatants with marketable skills in order to qualify them for employment can be assessed directly in terms of the percentage of trainees employed after a certain period of time. Those programs should be selected that achieve the highest effectiveness in terms of employment for a given level of cost.

The cost-effectiveness approach is suggested as an appropriate tool for evaluating human resource management programs, in particular if there is only one outcome or benefit to be considered. Cost-effectiveness studies face problems when there are several variables of interest and more than one outcome of the intervention is to be taken into account. Multiple effects may create problems in evaluating the cost-effectiveness of several alternatives. It may turn out that the best or most cost-effective alternative for one outcome is a poor choice to effect a different outcome. The challenge of multiple outcomes is to ascertain how one can set criteria to make cost-effective choices that take account of all of the important outcomes.

#### 4. A modified cost-benefit approach

In light of the strengths and weaknesses of traditional evaluation methodologies, an alternative approach has been developed to evaluate training projects. The approach has been successfully tested and applied in several African countries in the framework of an ILO project providing management training courses for micro-entrepreneurs in the informal sector (Nübler, 1993).

Efficiency of projects is determined by comparing benefits with costs. The discussion on cost-benefit analysis has shown that the identification and valuation of costs of training programs usually do not face major problems. The difficulties arise when evaluating the benefits. This challenge has been met through the development of a modified approach to evaluating the benefits of training programs.

The modified approach is based on the willingness to pay concept. The willingness to pay reveals the marginal value individuals attach to goods produced by a project. Traditional social cost-benefit analysis deals with the evaluation of physical outputs and services. These tangible outcomes are to be valued with the consumer's willingness to pay. It is expected that individual's willingness to pay precisely reflects their expectation of satisfaction. The UNIDO project evaluation approach applies this concept. Under conditions of perfect competition, the marginal value of a private good is equal to its market price (Dasgupta et al, 1972).

The outcomes of training projects, however, are not physical products or services, but rather tangible and intangible outcomes such as cognitive, affective and motivational changes in individuals, behavior, changes in business performance, etc. The modified approach does not attempt to place value on each of these outputs of the training project. Rather, the training itself is treated as the project's output. As a consequence, the training project can be evaluated by revealing a participant's willingness to pay for a similar type of training seminar. We assume that the value attached to another training seminar is based on the expectation of satisfaction which is determined by the benefits that participants derived from the previous training experience(2). The total value attached to the seminar, i.e. the benefit derived by all participants is determined by adding all participants' willingness to pay (Nübler, 1995).

It should be kept in mind, that the willingness to pay only reflects the direct benefits of the training project, i.e. benefits accrued by participants. Furthermore, empirical evidence shows that costs borne by the participants during the first seminar were taken into account in deciding the contribution. Therefore, the indicated willingness to pay has to be considered as the net benefit expected from another seminar. Consequently, costs borne by participants should be added to the willingness to pay when undertaking the cost analysis in order to avoid double counting.

The modified cost-benefit approach allows for evaluation of both costs and benefits and provides information on the efficiency of training projects, i.e. if the benefits outweigh the costs. This approach proved to be appropriate and feasible in an informal sector environment and therefore appears to also be an appropriate methodology in evaluating human resource development programs in the demobilization and reintegration context.

## 5. Selecting the appropriate evaluation methodology

The nature of the analytical task represents one important criterion that will determine the appropriate evaluation methodology. In the context of human resource management projects, cost-benefit analysis tends to be problematic. Levin concludes that "the restrictions imposed on the measurement of benefits and the time and other resources required to do such analyses will often preclude consideration of cost-benefit approaches" (Levin, 1983, p.113). In contrast, cost-effectiveness analysis can be applied under a wide variety of analytical tasks, and is considered an appropriate methodology in evaluating human resource management projects in the demobilization context as long as only one outcome is considered. Problems tend to arise when multiple outcomes have to be taken into account. Effectiveness studies provide relevant information on the degree of success or failure of human resource management programs with regard to several objectives. However, since costs are ignored, alternative interventions cannot be compared in terms of cost-effectiveness. The combination of an effectiveness study with a modified cost-benefit analysis appears very appropriate since information can be obtained on both the effectiveness and efficiency of human resource management programs, even in an environment where practical and methodological difficulties tend to be high.

In addition to the nature of the analytic task, the time that is available to carry out an analysis is an important criterion in selecting a particular evaluation methodology. The evaluation approach has to contrast the time to design the study, collect the data, and analyze the data with the time that is available.

Furthermore, the evaluation approach itself has to be cost-effective. If the project and the expected impact are small, then only a small investment in evaluation would be merited. However, when the value of an intervention can be very great, it may be worth making a large investment in evaluation and analysis. Anandarup (1984, p. 7) concludes that "...practical analysts must learn how to use the limited resources at hand most effectively, avoiding excessive detail and spurious precision and employing proxies and shortcuts suitable for the projects, with which they are concerned. The objective is to do the minimum necessary to resolve issues satisfactorily, rather than to meet puristic standards for their own sake. Practical work is neither for the faint-hearted nor for the perfectionist."

## VII. CONCLUSIONS

The relevance of former combatants and their capabilities during the demobilization and reintegration process may be analyzed in the framework of human capital theory, human resource approach and the human development concept. The human resource approach is considered the most appropriate and useful concept to analyze issues related to demobilization and reintegration of former combatants in Sub-Saharan Africa.

The human capital theory provides a rather narrow framework allowing mainly for analysis of human competencies for productive purposes. The human development concept is

considered too broad for the task it should perform, and the concept still faces substantial weaknesses at the theoretical and conceptual levels.

The human capital concept may be considered as one facet of the human resource concept and at the same time the human resource approach may be considered as an integral part of the human development concept. Within the human development concept, enlarging people's choices with respect to economic, social and political dimensions constitutes the ultimate objective of development. The human resource approach as it is presented in this paper also relates to economic, social and political objectives. In this sense, human development as the ultimate objective sets the norms, standards and goals to be achieved by human resource policies. The human resource concept provides the most appropriate analytical framework. The effects of the demobilization and reintegration process and the related human resource policies have to be evaluated in terms of human development.

Human resource management relates both to the effective utilization and to the development of human capacities. Both components play an important role in achieving short, medium and long-term objectives of demobilization and reintegration such as economic and social integration, political stability and security, social cohesion, and economic and human development.

Policies for effective utilization of human resources during reintegration may relate to the supply and demand side of the labor market such as the certification of skills, job placement measures, counseling, creation of employment, assistance to establish small enterprises, etc. Planning of policies and design of effective projects need to be based on data on existing skills, competencies, qualifications and experience of former combatants. Skill analysis should take a broad view and identify skills acquired at the cognitive, affective and psychomotor level. Furthermore, formal and traditional skills as well as strategic skills should be identified and the relevance of skills for various labor markets and occupations should be analyzed. In particular, it must be assessed to what extent the skills acquired in the military can be applied in civilian occupations.

Furthermore, information is required on the motivation, expectations and ambition of former fighters in order to match their plans with opportunities. Finally, particular attention should be given to the needs of special groups of demobilized combatants. The lack of coordinated programs for women, children and disabled persons is considered a major shortcoming in demobilization and reintegration strategies.

The development of human capabilities is the second important element of human resource management in demobilization and reintegration strategies. The formation of skills, knowledge and competencies contributes to economic and social integration. Economic integration is fostered by training for employment and self-employment. Training for direct employment needs to be strictly demand driven and be based on training needs analysis. Inadequate planning of training without data on the needs and market demand is considered as a main problem in reintegration strategies. In addition, care should be given to the specification and selection of trainees.

Training for enterprise creation in the informal sector can be effective, if feasibility studies have identified markets and demonstrate potentials for self-employment. Experience from

small enterprise development programs shows that start-up programs normally require more than training in order to be effective. These assistance packages, however, should not be too complex since costs may become very high. Furthermore, implementing organizations may have difficulties in handling packages requiring a variety of different expertise in areas such as training, credit, technology, etc. Training for small enterprise creation should be provided in particular to those former combatants, who are motivated to operate a small enterprise and to work in the occupation where training is provided.

Social integration tends to be promoted most effectively in training schemes that avoid marginalization and isolation of former combatants. Whenever possible, training should be provided in mainstream programs that do not treat ex-combatants as a distinct group in programs for vocational training. However, ex-combatants have special needs which should be addressed outside of mainstream programs. Social integration is fostered by schemes that link training to work such as apprenticeship, education in production, and family based training. These schemes tend to be particularly relevant for demobilized children fighters and young ex-fighters.

Training policies in post-war countries have to meet the challenge of providing skills for economic and social integration in the short and medium term and to develop and rehabilitate the training system. Promotion and use of all appropriate formal, non-formal, informal and traditional training modes is suggested in order to meet training needs during the demobilization and reintegration process. The rehabilitation, adjustment and long-term development of the training system should build incrementally from this existing base of institutions. Thus, the reintegration of demobilized combatants offers the opportunity to rehabilitate the training system, to increase effectiveness and efficiency, and to develop a comprehensive training system.

Measures, interventions and projects for human resource management should be effective in terms of objectives, and efficient in terms of costs and benefits. So far, little effort is made in the demobilization process to undertake evaluation studies. Therefore, limited evidence is available with respect to effectiveness, benefits and costs of training programs, counseling, or job placement activities after demobilization. Such information, however, is highly relevant for planners and decision makers in order to allocate funds to activities, policy measures and projects, where effectiveness and efficiency can be expected to be high.

Demobilization and reintegration strategies tend to focus mainly on aspects of human resource formation while policies for effective utilization are given less attention. A broader view in skills and competencies might, however, reveal some skills and qualifications possessed by ex-combatants that can be of benefit to the individual and to society. It is suggested that attention be given to utilization and development of human resources and selecting those projects that are most efficient or cost-effective in terms of economic and social integration.

Methodologies in evaluating interventions during demobilization and reintegration must be appropriate in light of the task, time and resources available. Traditional evaluation methodologies such as cost-benefit analysis tend to be rather difficult to apply. However, cost-effectiveness studies appear to be appropriate, in particular, when different projects

are to be compared with respect to one objective. Furthermore, a modified cost-benefit approach that evaluates benefits of training programs on the basis of participants' willingness to pay for further training, appears to present an appropriate evaluation approach in the context of demobilization. If this approach is combined with an effectiveness study, then data on effectiveness and efficiency of projects can be obtained.

We conclude that the design of effective human resource management programs requires a minimum of analytical and research activities such as skills analysis of former combatants, data on expectations and plans of demobilized fighters, training needs analysis and analysis of labor and goods markets. Such analysis has been neglected in many countries due to time pressure, lack of funds or experts. Demobilization strategies should give much more attention to analysis and strengthen their research component. More analytical work is required in order to plan and design effective programs in human resource management, and studies are required to monitor and evaluate the outcome and costs of interventions.

#### VIII. REFERENCES

Anandarup, R.. 1984. *Cost-benefit Analysis; Issues and Methodologies*. A World Bank Publication. Washington D.C.: The Johns Hopkins University Press.

Azam, J.-P., D. Bevan, P. Collier, S. Dercon, J. Gunning and S. Pradhan. 1994. "Some Economic Consequences of the Transition from Civil War to Peace." Policy Research Working Paper 1392. Policy Research Department, Public Economics Division. Washington D.C. World Bank.

Ball, N. 1988. *Security and Economy in the Third World*. London: Adamantine Press.

Becker, G. S. 1975. *Human Capital*. New York: National Bureau of Economic Research.

Benson, C., 1989. *Taxonomies of Skill Development: A Search for Criteria to Define the Relative Efficiency of Alternative Programs of Occupational Training*. Washington D.C.: World Bank, Population and Human Resources Department.

Bonn International Center for Conversion (BICC). 1996. *Conversion Survey 1996*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Boomgard, J. J. 1989. *A.I.D. Microenterprise Stock-Taking: Synthesis Report*. Washington D.C.: U.S. Agency for International Development, Center for Development Information and Evaluation, Bureau for Program and Policy Coordination.

- Bowman, M. J. 1980. "Education and Economic Growth: An Overview." In T. King ed. Education and Income. World Bank Staff Working Paper No. 402, pp. 1-71.
- Boyce, J. K. December 1995. "Adjustment towards Peace: An Introduction." World Development Vol 23, Nr. 12, pp. 2067-2077.
- Campbell, J. P. and R. D. Pritchard. 1976. "Motivation Theory in Industrial and Organizational Psychology." In Dunette, M. D. ed. 1976. Handbook of Industrial and Organizational Psychology. Chicago: Rand McNally.
- Cohen, S. I. 1994. Human Resource Development and Utilization. Aldershot: Avebury.
- Colclough, Ch., 1982. "The Impact of Primary Schooling on Economic Development: A Review of the Evidence." World Development Vol. 10, No. 3, pp. 167-185.
- Colletta, N. J., M. Kostner, and I. Wiederhofer. 1996. War-to-Peace Transition in Sub-Saharan Africa. Directions in Development. Washington D.C.: World Bank.
- Collier, P. and S. Pradhan. 1994. "Economic Aspects of the Ugandan Transition to Peace." In Azam et al., pp. 119-133.
- Dasgupta, P., S. Marglin, and A. Sen. 1972. Guidelines for Project Evaluation. New York: UNIDO.
- Fluitman, F, ed. 1989. Training for Work in the Informal Sector." Geneva: ILO.
- Goodale, G. 1989. "Training for Women in the Informal Sector." In Fluitman, F. ed., pp. 47-69.
- Gill, I. S. and S. R. Khandker. 1991. How Structure of Production Determinants the Demand for Human Capital. Policy, Research and External Affairs. Working Paper S725. Washington D.C.: World Bank.
- Haq, M. ul. 1995. Reflections on Human Development. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Harbison, F. H. 1973. *Human Resources as the Wealth of Nations.* New York, London: Oxford University Press.

Harper, M. 1989. "Training and Technical Assistance for Microenterprises." In Levitsky, J. pp. 177-188.

Havemann, R. H. and B. L. Wolfe. 1984. "Schooling and Economic Well-Being: The Role of Non-Market Effects." *Journal of Human Resources* Vol. 19, No.3, pp. 377-407.

Inkeles, A. and D. Smith. 1974. *Becoming Modern.* Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press.

International Labor Organization (ILO). 1986. *Vocational Training.* Geneva.

\_\_\_\_\_. 1995a. "Reintegration of Demobilized Combatants: Experiences from Four African Countries." Prepared for the Expert Meeting on the Design of Guidelines for Training and Employment of Ex-Combatants, Harare, 11-14 July 1995.

\_\_\_\_\_. 1995b. "The Reintegration of Young Ex-Combatants into Civilian Life." Prepared for the Expert Meeting on the Design of Guidelines for Training and Employment of Ex-Combatants, Harare, 11-14 July 1995.

\_\_\_\_\_. 1995c "Rehabilitation and Reintegration of Disabled Ex-Combatants." Prepared for the Expert Meeting on the Design of Guidelines for Training and Employment of Ex-Combatants, Harare, 11-14 July 1995.

\_\_\_\_\_. 1995d "Reintegration of demobilized combatants through (self-)employment and training." Prepared for the Expert Meeting on the Design of Guidelines for Training and Employment of Ex-Combatants, Harare, 11-14 July 1995.

\_\_\_\_\_. 1995e "Reintegrating demobilized combatants: The role of small enterprise development." Prepared for the Expert Meeting on the Design of Guidelines for Training and Employment of Ex-Combatants, Harare, 11-14 July 1995.

Jamison, T. and R. Moock. 1984. "Farmer Education and Farm Efficiency in Nepal: The Role of Schooling, Extension Services, and Cognitive Skills." *World Development* Vol. 12, No. 1, pp. 67-86.

- Jennings, M. 1988. "Promoting Women's Role in Mainstream Projects in Lesotho." Geneva: ILO.
- Kerschensteiner, G. 1926. *Theorie der Bildung*. Leipzig.
- Kiggundu, M. N. 1989. *Managing Organizations in Developing Countries An Operational and Strategic Approach*. West Hartford, CT: Kumarian Press.
- Kiker, B. F. 1966. "The Historical Roots of the Concept of Human Capital." *The Journal of Political Economy*, February-December, pp. 481-499.
- Kilby, P. 1988. "Breaking the Entrepreneurial Bottle-neck in Late-developing Countries: Is there a Useful Role for Government?" *Journal of Development Planning* No. 18, pp. 221-249.
- King, K. 1990. "Research, Policy and the Informal Sector: An African Experience." In Turnham, Salomé and Schwartz eds., pp. 131-153.
- Kingma, K. 1995. "Demobilisierung und Wiedereingliederung von Soldaten: Wichtige Schritte im Friedensprozeß." In Birckenbach, H.-M., U. Jäger, and C. Wellmann, eds.: *Jahrbuch Frieden 1996*, Verlag C.H. Beck, München, pp. 177-188.
- Klingebl, S. et al. 1995. *Promoting the Reintegration of Former Female and Male Combatants in Eritrea*. Berlin: German Development Institute.
- Lauglo, J., and A. Närman. 1988. *Diversified Secondary Education in Kenya: The Status of Practical Subjects and their Uses after School*. Pergamon Comparative & International Education Series, Vol. 6, pp. 235-256. Oxford: Pergamon Press.
- Leibenstein, H. 1988. "Entrepreneurship and Development." *Journal of Development Planning*, No. 18.
- Levin, H. M. 1983. *Cost-effectiveness. A Primer. New Perspectives in Evaluation*. Vol. 4. Beverly Hills: Sage Publications.

Levitsky, J., ed. 1989. *Microenterprises in Developing Countries*. London: Intermediate Technology.

Lucas, R. E. 1988. "On the Mechanics of Economic Development." *Journal of Monetary Economics*. January, pp. 3-22.

Maglen, I. R. 1994. "Challenging the Human Capital Orthodoxy: The Education-Productivity Link Re-examined." *The Economic Record*. December, Vol. 66, No. 195, pp. 281-294.

Matthies, V. 1994. *Äthiopien, Eritrea, Somalia, Djibouti. Das Horn von Afrika*. Munich.

McClelland, D. C. 1961. *The Achieving Society*. New Jersey: D. Van Nostrand.

McLaughlin, S. 1989. *Skill Training for the Informal Sector: Analyzing the Success and Limitations of Support Programs*. Education and Employment Division. PHREE Background Paper No. PHREE/89/05. Washington D.C.: World Bank.

McNabb, R. and K. Whitfield. 1994. "The Market for Training: An Overview." In McNabb, R. et al. eds.: *The Market for Training*. Aldershot: Avebury. pp. 1-18.

Metcalf, H. 1984. "The Economics of Vocational Training. Past Evidence and Future Considerations". Staff Working Paper No. 713. Washington D.C.: World Bank.

Mikkelsen, B. 1995. *Methods for Development Work and Research*. London: Sage Publications.

Mingat, A. et al. 1989. *L'Enseignement Technique court au Niger: Une Evaluation par le Marche*. Dijon, IREDU.

Nölker, O. and E. Schoenfeldt. 1985. *Glossar: Internationale Berufspädagogik*. GTZ: Expert Verlag.

Nübler, I. 1991. "Limits to Change in Training Systems: The Case of Germany." Discussion Paper No. 85, Geneva: Training Department, ILO.

\_\_\_\_\_. 1993. "Training Microentrepreneurs - Does it pay?" *Small Enterprise Development*, Vol. 3, No. 4, pp. 34-44.

\_\_\_\_\_. 1995. "Management Training for Women Microentrepreneurs: An Evaluation Methodology and Case Studies from Africa." Ph.D. thesis, Free University of Berlin.

Pradhan, R. D. 1989. "On Helping Small Enterprises in Developing Countries." *World Development* Vol. 17, No. 1, pp. 157-159.

Prokopenko, J. 1989. *Productivity Management*. Geneva: ILO.

Psacharopoulos, G. 1988. "Education and Development. A Review." *Research Observer*. Vol. 3, No. 1, Washington, D.C.: World Bank, pp. 99-116.

Richter, L. 1986. *Training Needs Assessment and Monitoring*. Geneva: ILO.

Roemer, N. and J. J. Stern. 1974. *The Appraisal of Development Projects: A Practical Guide to Project Analysis with Case Studies and Solutions*. New York.

Rosen, S. 1987. "Human Capital." *The New Palgrave*. London, pp. 681-689.

Schultz, T. W. 1961. "Investment in Human Capital." *The American Economic Review*. Vol. II, pp. 1-17.

\_\_\_\_\_. 1975. "The Value of the Ability to Deal with Disequilibria." *Journal of Economic Literature* Vol. 13, No. 3, pp. 827-846.

Sen, A. K. 1991. "The Concept of Development." In H. Chenery and T. N. Srinivasan, eds.: *Handbook of Development Economies*. Vol. II, Amsterdam: North-Holland, pp. 9-26.

Srivastava, R. 1994. *Reintegrating Demobilized Combatants: A Report Exploring Options and Strategies for Training-Related Interventions*. Geneva: International Labor Organization.

Stone, E. F. 1982. "Research Design: Issues in Studies Assessing the Effects of Management Education." In R. D. Freedman, et al., eds. *Management Education. Issues in Theory, Research, and Practice*. Chichester: John Wiley and Sons.

Tendler, J. 1989. "Whatever happened to Poverty Alleviation." In Levitsky.

Todaro, M. 1995. *Economic Development*. New York: Longman.

Turnham, D., B. Salomé and A. Schwarz, eds. 1990. *The Informal Sector Revisited*. Paris: OECD Development Centre.

UNDP. 1990. *Human Development Report 1990*. New York: Oxford University Press.

Vroom, V. H. 1964. *Work and Motivation*. New York: John Wiley and Sons.

Welch, F. 1970. "Education in Production." *Journal of Political Economy* Vol. 78, No. 1, pp. 35-59.

Williamson, O. 1975. "Franchise Bidding for Natural Monopolies." *Bell Journal of Economics*. Nr. 7, pp. 73-104.

World Bank, 1989. *Sub-Saharan Africa: From Crisis to Sustainable Growth*. Washington, D.C.: World Bank.

\_\_\_\_\_. 1993. *Demobilization and Reintegration of Military Personnel in Africa: The Evidence from Seven Country Case Studies*". Africa Regional Series Discussion Paper IDP-130. Washington D.C.

Zegers, M. 1988. *Management Training for Small Scale Entrepreneurs in the Context of a Developing Country*. Ph.D. Thesis, Amsterdam: Free University Press.

Notes:

A preliminary review of demobilization experience in Africa concludes that "Although training courses were offered in each of the countries ... little follow-up information is available to assess their long-term viability, whether they have benefited most of those

wanting to participate and how effective and relevant the courses were for veterans' subsequent civilian careers. Similar few studies have been completed on the success of the employment creation programs often associated with training programs" (World Bank 1993, p. xiv).

Participants should be asked for their willingness to pay only some time after the training experience in order to give enough time to realize benefits. In order to be willing to reveal their willingness to pay participants should be give the information that the planned seminar has to be financed entirely by participants' contributions.